How To Refine the FRBR Hierarchy: a Case Study of Expressions of Works by Children's Author Eileen Christelow

Frank Newton

Gardner-Webb University

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.gardner-webb.edu/doverlibfacpub

Part of the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning Commons

Recommended Citation

Newton, Frank, "How To Refine the FRBR Hierarchy: a Case Study of Expressions of Works by Children's Author Eileen Christelow" (2018). Dover Library Faculty Professional Development Activities. 13.
https://digitalcommons.gardner-webb.edu/doverlibfacpub/13
How To Refine the FRBR Hierarchy:
a Case Study of Expressions of Works by Children's Author Eileen Christelow

researched and written by
Frank Newton
Catalog Librarian
Dover Memorial Library
Gardner-Webb University
Boiling Springs, N.C. -- fnewton@gardner-webb.edu

Ohio Valley Group of Technical Services Librarians
Annual Conference, Notre Dame, May 14th, 2018
Introduction and Literature Review
Title Page of FRBR (1st edition of 1998)
The Human Authors of FRBR  
(FRBR p. iv)

• **Members of the IFLA Study Group**
  • Olivia Madison (Chair), Iowa State University Library
  • John Byrum, Jr., Library of Congress
  • Suzanne Jouguelet, Bibliothèque nationale de France
  • Dorothy McGarry, University of California, Los Angeles
  • Nancy Williamson, Faculty of Information Studies, University of Toronto
  • Maria Witt, Médiathèque de la Cité des Sciences, Paris

• **Consultants**
  • Tom Delsey, National Library of Canada
  • Elizabeth Dulabahn, Library of Congress
  • Elaine Svenonius, University of California, Los Angeles
  • Barbara Tillett, Library of Congress
Two Acronyms

**FRBR**
- Functional
- Requirements for
- Bibliographic
- Records

**WEMI**
- Work
- Expression
- Manifestation
- Item
The FRBR or WEMI Hierarchy
(FRBR figure 3.1, page 14)

"Group 1 Entities and Primary Relationships"
[That's the label for the FRBR hierarchy as it was published in FRBR!]

Work

is realized through

Expression

is embodied in

Manifestation

is exemplified by

Item
A Proposed New Level of the Hierarchy: the Level of the Bibliographic Record
Good Editions and Bad Editions

• Why do we have separate bibliographic records for different editions?

"Oedipa showed [Professor Bortz] the paperback with the line in it. . . . [Bortz] announced, 'I've been pirated, me and Wharfinger, we've been Bowdlerized in reverse or something.' He flipped to the front, to see who'd re-edited his edition of Wharfinger. ‘Ashamed to sign it? Damn. I'll have to write the publishers. K. da Chingado and Company? You ever heard of them? New York.’ He looked at the sun through a page or two. 'Offset.' Brought his nose close to the text. 'Misprints. Gah. Corrupt.' He dropped the book on the grass and looked at it with loathing."

The Inequality of Library Users in the Academic Library

• Professor Bortz used these words:
  • pirated
  • Bowdlerized in reverse
  • re-edited
  • offset
  • misprints

• Teachers are power users of academic libraries and library catalogs!
• Teachers care about the differences between one edition and another!
Inequality (continued)

Coyle (FRBR, Before and After, p. 100):

"Some of the [FRBR] attributes are only of low importance, which brings into question why they are even included as necessary attributes. For example, the Work/Work relationships [known as] summarization, adaptation, transformation, and imitation are listed as low value for [the user tasks of] identify and select. Had the focus of the [FRBR] report truly been user needs, it is doubtful that those attributes would have been included."
Method
Eileen Christelow
(http://www.christelow.com/)
Also from Christelow’s website

Many years and books later, we’re still in Vermont. I’m on top of Ascutney Mountain which looks out over my grandparent’s old farm. My cousins and I still come up here and remember those years when we were kids.
Deborah and Richard Fritz studied this book by Christelow
From *RIMMF Notes* by Deborah and Richard Fritz
https://rimmf.wordpress.com/rimmfing-examples/five-little-monkeys-wash-the-car/

*Five little monkeys wash the car*

This FRBR diagram shows that we need data on four aspects of this resource. We need data for its:

1. Work aspect (W)
2. Expression aspect (E)
3. Manifestation aspect (M)
4. Author (P)
Deborah & Richard Fritz: Work Record for
*Five Little Monkeys Wash the Car*

---

**Element Label** | **Text** | **RDA Rule**
--- | --- | ---
Creator | | 19.2.1
Title of the Work | | 6.2.1
Preferred Title for the Work | Five little monkeys wash the car | 6.2.2
Authorized Access Point † | Christelow, Eileen. Five little monkeys wash the car | 6.27.1
Intended Audience | Children | 7.7.1
Expression of Work | | 17.5.1
RIMMF Identifier † | | no rule
RIMMF Identifier † | qppq00000154 | no rule

---

Work data
Deborah & Richard Fritz: Expression Record for

*Five Little Monkeys Wash the Car*
Deborah & Richard Fritz: Manifestation Record for

Five Little Monkeys Wash the Car

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element Label</th>
<th>Text</th>
<th>RDA Rule</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Manifestation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Five little monkeys wash the car</td>
<td>2.3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title Proper</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of Responsibility</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper</td>
<td>Eileen Christelow</td>
<td>2.4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publication Statement</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Place of Publication</td>
<td>New York, NY</td>
<td>2.8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publisher’s Name</td>
<td>Clarion Books</td>
<td>2.9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date of Publication</td>
<td>[2000]</td>
<td>2.8.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Copyright Date</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>2.11.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode of Issuance</td>
<td>single unit</td>
<td>2.13.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identifier for the Manifestation</td>
<td>ISBN: 0618985602X</td>
<td>2.15.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media Type</td>
<td>unmediated</td>
<td>3.2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carrier Type</td>
<td>volume</td>
<td>3.3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of units †</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>no rule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extent</td>
<td>pages</td>
<td>3.4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dimensions</td>
<td>21 x 25 cm</td>
<td>3.5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMIHF Identifier †</td>
<td>qpp00000157</td>
<td>no rule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composite Key †</td>
<td>Five little monkeys wash the car</td>
<td>no rule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expression Manifested</td>
<td>Clarion Books, [2000], volume</td>
<td>no rule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMIHF Identifier †</td>
<td>Christelow, Eileen. Five little monkeys</td>
<td>17.4.2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>wash the car. Text qpp00000157</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Search Strategy in OCLC Connexion

"OCLC Connexion - [WorldCat Group List (652 matches):
pn = "christol, eileen"]"

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Format</th>
<th>Dates</th>
<th>Records</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Books</td>
<td>1900-1989</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Books</td>
<td>1990-1995</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Books</td>
<td>1996-2003</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Books</td>
<td>2004-2007</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Books</td>
<td>2008-2016</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Books</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Books</td>
<td>NO DATE</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textual Serials</td>
<td>NO DATE</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visual Materials</td>
<td>1984-2014</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed Materials</td>
<td>1967-2017</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sound Recordings</td>
<td>1900-2014</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sound Recordings</td>
<td>NO DATE</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Files</td>
<td>2000-2016</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### First Sheet of the Spreadsheet: OCLC Bib. Records

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A</th>
<th>Name [Main Entry]</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Library</th>
<th>Hold</th>
<th>No. of libraries</th>
<th>OCLC #</th>
<th>Cat. Lang.</th>
<th>Language of Edition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>Five little monkeys jumping on the bed</td>
<td>Clarion Books</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>299319848</td>
<td>eng eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>Going to the doctor.</td>
<td></td>
<td>1985</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>30714382</td>
<td>eng eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>Hu, sá hemsí!</td>
<td>Richters,</td>
<td>1988</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>480289888</td>
<td>dan swe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>Dear Phoebe</td>
<td>Little Brown,</td>
<td>1984 D</td>
<td>252</td>
<td>10145550</td>
<td>eng eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Alexander, Sue, 1933-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Aylesworth, Jim.</td>
<td>Hu, sá hemsí!</td>
<td>Richter,</td>
<td>1988</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>742698937</td>
<td>eng swe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Aylesworth, Jim.</td>
<td>Hu, sá hemsí!</td>
<td>Richter,</td>
<td>1988</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>196484962</td>
<td>swe swe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Aylesworth, Jim.</td>
<td>Two terrible frights.</td>
<td>Viking Kastrel,</td>
<td>1987</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>614560190</td>
<td>eng eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Aylesworth, Jim.</td>
<td>Two terrible frights.</td>
<td>Athenaeum,</td>
<td>1987 D</td>
<td>079</td>
<td>14271202</td>
<td>eng eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Aylesworth, Jim.</td>
<td>Two terrible frights.</td>
<td>Viking Kastrel,</td>
<td>1989 B</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>197411101</td>
<td>eng eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Aylesworth, Jim.</td>
<td>Two terrible frights.</td>
<td>Viking Kastrel,</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>906585558</td>
<td>dut eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Campbell, Wayne.</td>
<td>What a catastrophe!</td>
<td>Bradbury Press,</td>
<td>1987</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>499796782</td>
<td>eng eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Christelow, Eileen.</td>
<td>Barbara Miller read-aloud: five little monkeys jumping on the bed</td>
<td>Clarion Books,</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>830284049</td>
<td>eng eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Christelow, Eileen.</td>
<td>Five little monkeys go shopping: back to school stuff for five little monkeys</td>
<td>Clarion Books,</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>769040534</td>
<td>eng eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Christelow, Eileen.</td>
<td>Five little monkeys jumping on the bed</td>
<td>Houghton Mifflin Harcourt,</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>959987558</td>
<td>eng eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Christelow, Eileen.</td>
<td>Five little monkeys jumping on the bed</td>
<td>Clarion Books,</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>921139948</td>
<td>eng eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Christelow, Eileen, author.</td>
<td>Five little monkeys jumping on the bed</td>
<td>HMH Books,</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>880942373</td>
<td>eng eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Christelow, Eileen.</td>
<td>Five little monkeys jumping on the bed</td>
<td>Clarion Books,</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>863040750</td>
<td>eng eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Christelow, Eileen.</td>
<td>Five little monkeys jumping on the bed</td>
<td>Cover Illustration,</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>811259280</td>
<td>eng eng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Second Sheet of the Spreadsheet: Bib. Records Arranged by Work

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Retrieval</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Library</th>
<th>Held</th>
<th>No. of Libraries</th>
<th>OCLC #</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>381</td>
<td>THE DESPERATE DOG WRITES AGAIN.</td>
<td>Clarion Books,</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Held/LHR</td>
<td>1084</td>
<td>444871628</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>379</td>
<td>The desperate dog writes again</td>
<td>Houghton Mifflin Harcourt,</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>865334937</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>380</td>
<td>The desperate dog writes again</td>
<td>Clarion Books,</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
<td>774281195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>115</td>
<td>DON'T WAKE UP MAMA!</td>
<td>Clarion Books,</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td>1080</td>
<td>25165520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>110</td>
<td>Don't wake up Mama! another five little monkeys story</td>
<td>Clarion</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>608925887</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>111</td>
<td>Don't wake up Mama! another five little monkeys story</td>
<td>Trumpet Club,</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>785889003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>112</td>
<td>Don't wake up Mama! another five little monkeys story</td>
<td>Clarion Books,</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>761956413</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>113</td>
<td>Don't wake up Mama! another five little monkeys story</td>
<td>Scholastic Inc.,</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>82</td>
<td>43895157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>114</td>
<td>Don't wake up Mama! another five little monkeys story</td>
<td>Trumpet Club,</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>24</td>
<td>31349608</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>116</td>
<td>Don't wake up Mama! another five little monkeys story</td>
<td>Trumpet Club,</td>
<td>1994</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>26</td>
<td>21353313</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Results
Introduction to Duplicate Records

• Jay Weitz 2016 provides a brief overview of OCLC’s Duplicate Detection and Resolution program. He notes that manual deduplication of OCLC WorldCat goes back to 1983, while automated deduplication has been going on since 1991.

• Peter Christen 2012 (*Data Matching*) provides computer science introduction to the steps involved in deduplication within a database, and matching records across databases – mainly deals w. databases of personal information, but touches on bibliographic databases.

• Criteria for duplicate records followed here (next 2 slides) much less stringent than OCLC’s Duplicate Detection and Resolution criteria.
Beginning of List of Works Authored by Christelow

W1 The Desperate Dog Writes Again.
E1 The Desperate Dog Writes Again
B1 444871628 [Clarion Books] -- 32 pp. ; 29 cm

W2 Don't Wake Up Mama! [Later title: Five Little Monkeys Bake a Birthday Cake]
E1a Don't Wake Up Mama!
B1 25165520 -- 29 pp. ; 21 x 26 cm
Translations as Expressions
(W2  Don’t Wake Up Mama! cont’d)

E2     Shwit! ōmma kkaeuji ma! [Korean translation of Don’t Wake Up Mama!]

E3     Wu zhi xiao hou zi kao sheng ri dan gao [Chinese translation of Five Little Monkeys Bake a Birthday Cake]

E4     Cinco Monitos Hacen un Pastel de Cumpleaños [Spanish translation of Five Little Monkeys Bake a Birthday Cake]
        B1       173748056 -- 1 vol. (unpaged) ; 13 x 16 cm
        On board pages.
        B1       867610686 -- 32 unnumb. pp. ; 17 x 19 cm
        B2       902698496 -- Encoding Level M -- 32 unnumb. pp. ; 17 x 19 cm [same ISBN]
Mapping the Expression Territory: Three Views of the Levels Between Work and Manifestation

"Group 1 Entities and Primary Relationships"
[That's the label for the FRBR hierarchy as it was published in FRBR!]

Work
  is realized through
  Expression
    is embodied in
    Manifestation
      is exemplified by
      Item
First View: Fully Hierarchical, with Format Above Language
Second View: Fully Hierarchical, with Language Above Format
Third View: Partly Hierarchical, with Format and Language Operating at the Same Level
I like “FRBR Hierarchy” better than “WEMI Hierarchy” because

If you say “FRBR Hierarchy” and you add a level to the hierarchy or you subtract a level from the hierarchy, you don’t have to change the acronym!
# The Level of the Sub-Expression: Two Chinese Translations of *Five Little Monkeys Sitting in a Tree*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OCLC #</th>
<th>Title in Chinese characters</th>
<th>Title in Romanization</th>
<th>Publisher's Location</th>
<th>Publisher Capitalized</th>
<th>Year of Pub.</th>
<th>Translator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>437430856</td>
<td>五隻猴子在樹上</td>
<td>Wu zhi hou zai shu shang</td>
<td>Taipéi, Taiwan</td>
<td>Weijing Guoji Gufen Youxian Gongsì</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Fang Suzhēn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>769802739</td>
<td>五只小猴子坐在樹上面</td>
<td>Wu zhi xiao hou zai zuo shu shang mian</td>
<td>Changsha, (mainland) China</td>
<td>Hunan Shao-nian Ertong Chuban She</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Ren Róngróng</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OCLC #</th>
<th>Title in Chinese characters</th>
<th>Title in Romanization</th>
<th>Publisher's Location</th>
<th>Publisher Capitalized</th>
<th>Year of Pub.</th>
<th>Translator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>437430856</td>
<td>五 Wǔ 隻 zhī 猴 hóu zi 在 zài 樹 shù 上 shang</td>
<td>Wu zhi hou zai shu shang</td>
<td>Taipéi, Taiwan</td>
<td>Weijing Guoji Gufen Youxian Gongsì</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Fang Suzhēn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>769802739</td>
<td>五 Wǔ 只 zhī 小 xiăo 猴子 hóu zi 坐 zuò 在 zài 樹 shù 上 shàng 面 mian</td>
<td>Wu zhi xiao hou zai zuo shu shang mian</td>
<td>Changsha, (mainland) China</td>
<td>Hunan Shao-nian Ertong Chuban She</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Ren Róngróng</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Literal back-translation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OCLC #</th>
<th>Title in Chinese characters</th>
<th>Title in Romanization</th>
<th>Publisher's Location</th>
<th>Publisher Capitalized</th>
<th>Year of Pub.</th>
<th>Translator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>437430856</td>
<td>五 Wǔ 隻 zhī 猴 hóu zi 在 zài 樹 shù 上 shang</td>
<td>Wu zhi hou zai shu shang</td>
<td>Taipéi, Taiwan</td>
<td>Weijing Guoji Gufen Youxian Gongsì</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Fang Suzhēn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>769802739</td>
<td>五 Wǔ 只 zhī 小 xiăo 猴子 hóu zi 坐 zuò 在 zài 樹 shù 上 shàng 面 mian</td>
<td>Wu zhi xiao hou zai zuo shu shang mian</td>
<td>Changsha, (mainland) China</td>
<td>Hunan Shao-nian Ertong Chuban She</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Ren Róngróng</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Literal back-translation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OCLC #</th>
<th>Title in Chinese characters</th>
<th>Title in Romanization</th>
<th>Publisher's Location</th>
<th>Publisher Capitalized</th>
<th>Year of Pub.</th>
<th>Translator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>437430856</td>
<td>五 Wǔ 隴 zhī 猴子 hóu zi 在 zài 樹 shù 上 shang</td>
<td>Wu zhi hou zai shu shang</td>
<td>Taipéi, Taiwan</td>
<td>Weijing Guoji Gufen Youxian Gongsì</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Fang Suzhēn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>769802739</td>
<td>五 Wǔ 只 zhī 小 xiăo 猴子 hóu zi 坐 zuò 在 zài 樹 shù 上 shàng 面 mian</td>
<td>Wu zhi xiao hou zai zuo shu shang mian</td>
<td>Changsha, (mainland) China</td>
<td>Hunan Shao-nian Ertong Chuban She</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Ren Róngróng</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Literal back-translation**
Musings on FRBR
First Musing:
I Come Not to Bury FRBR, But to Praise It

“I come to bury Caesar, not to praise him.” – Shakespeare

(*We have played with our source, alluding, not quoting!)
Second Musing:
Living Theories and Dead Theories

Coyle (FRBR, Before and After, p. 130):

"This rigidity, as well as the fact that FRBR is considered “true” in its current form, means that any application must be either FRBR or not-FRBR, thus splitting the bibliographic world into noncompatible factions."
FRBRization


“**FRBRization.** The attempt to model in bibliographic systems the entity structure described in *Functional Requirements for Bibliographic Records (FRBR)*, based on the concepts of work, expression, manifestation, and item. Pronounced 'furburization.' "
Third Musing:
Let the Relationship Between the FRBR Levels Be a Set-Subset Relationship

• The description of the relationship between FRBR levels can be standardized to this wording: “is a set of.”

• We label intermediate levels in the FRBR hierarchy twice, above in the plural and below in the singular. That is a linguistic strategy, so that we can use our natural language as we have received it to express FRBR relationships.
Connective Words in the FRBR Hierarchy

- Work
  - is realized through
    - Expression
      - is embodied in
        - Manifestation
          - is exemplified by
            - Item
Revised FRBR Hierarchy: Preliminary Diagram

- Work ➔ Expression ➔ Manifestation ➔ Item
- A Work is a set of Expressions, each Expression is a set of Manifestations, each Manifestation is a set of Items.
Revised FRBR Hierarchy: Incorporating Results of Our Discussion

- Work
- Expression
- Sub-expression
- Manifestation
- Bib. Record
- Item
Fourth Musing:
Good Stewardship of the Patrimony of Bibliographic Records

• Do not spit upon the inheritance which you have inherited.

• Be conservationist-minded.
Fifth Musing:
Who Will Define the Levels of the FRBR Hierarchy?

IFLA
Sixth Musing: Reintegration of FRBR Levels: What Catalog Consulters Want

Smiraglia’s citation of one of Panizzi’s works (Smiraglia 2001 page 139):

The Fritzes’ Work Level Record Repeated

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element Label</th>
<th>Text</th>
<th>RDA Rule</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creator</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>19.2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship Designators for</td>
<td>Christelow, Eileen &lt;qpq00000155&gt;</td>
<td>18.5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creators</td>
<td></td>
<td>18.4.1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title of the Work</td>
<td>Five little monkeys wash the car</td>
<td>6.2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preferred Title for the Work</td>
<td>Christelow, Eileen. Five little monkeys wash the</td>
<td>6.2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authorized Access Point</td>
<td>car</td>
<td>6.27.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intended Audience</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>7.7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expression of Work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RIMMF Identifier</td>
<td>Christelow, Eileen. Five little monkeys wash the</td>
<td>17.4.2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RIMMF Identifier</td>
<td>car. Text &lt;qpq00000156&gt;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RIMMF Identifier</td>
<td>qpq00000154</td>
<td>no rule</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Work data
The Fritzes’ Expression Level Record Repeated
Final Musing: Bibliographic Taxonomy

A Taxonomic Sketch of Dogs and a Few of Their Relatives
From the Animal Diversity Web
(https://animaldiversity.org/accounts/Canis/classification/)

(It continues down from vertebrates. This screenshot just shows the top part of this web page.)
Bibliography


• Coyle, Karen. *FRBR, Before and After: a Look at Our Bibliographic Models*. ALA Editions, and open access with a Creative Commons attribution license (CC-BY license), the latter downloadable from http://kcoyle.net/beforeAndAfter/index.html.


  
  Note. The claim that this website is authored by Deborah and Richard Fritz is taken from a different website, namely http://www.marcofquality.com/wiki/rimmf3/doku.php?id=faq_.


  This is the first article in the following book/journal issue.

